

# EXHIBIT 3

Page 4513

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE 17TH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT  
IN AND FOR BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA

CIRCUIT CIVIL DIVISION (08)

JUDGE DAVID A. HAIMES

---

IN RE: ENGLE PROGENY CASES  
TOBACCO LITIGATION

Pertains to: DEBORAH NEFF, as  
Personal Representative of the  
Estate of DOROTHY MILINKOVICH

Case No.: 07-036745(08)

---

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS  
JURY TRIAL  
Volume 27, Pages 4513 - 4645

DATE TAKEN: March 21, 2019  
TIME: (1:15) 1:21 p.m. - 3:27 p.m.  
PLACE: Broward County Courthouse  
201 S.E. 6th Street  
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301  
BEFORE: DAVID A. HAIMES, Circuit Court Judge

This cause came on to be heard at the time and  
place aforesaid, when and where the following  
proceedings were reported by:

Tracey S. LoCastro, RPR, FPR  
United Reporting, Inc.  
1218 S.E. 3rd Avenue  
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33316  
954.525.2221

1 APPEARANCES:

2 APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF:

3 SCHLESINGER LAW OFFICES, P.A.  
4 1212 Southeast 3rd Avenue  
5 Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33316  
6 954.320.9507

7 BY: SCOTT P. SCHLESINGER, ESQUIRE  
8 scott@schlesingerlaw.com

9 BY: STEVEN J. HAMMER, ESQUIRE  
10 sjh@schlesingerlaw.com

11 BY: BRITTANY CHAMBERS, ESQUIRE  
12 bchambers@schlesingerlaw.com

13 BRANNOCK & HUMPHRIES  
14 1111 W. Cass Street  
15 Suite 200

16 Tampa, Florida 33606  
17 By: CELENE HUMPHRIES, ESQ.  
18 info@BHAppeals.com

19 APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANT R.J. REYNOLDS  
20 TOBACCO COMPANY, INDIVIDUALLY AND AS SUCCESSOR BY  
21 MERGER TO LORILLARD TOBACCO COMPANY:

22 KING & SPALDING, LLP  
23 1180 Peachtree Street, N.E.  
24 Atlanta, Georgia 30309  
25 404.572.4600

BY: W. RAY PERSONS, ESQUIRE  
rpersons@kslaw.com

BY: PHILIP R. GREEN, ESQUIRE  
pgreen@kslaw.com

BY: SPENCER M. DIAMOND, ESQUIRE  
sdiamond@kslaw.com

APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANT PHILIP MORRIS USA  
INC.:

BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER, LLP  
100 S.E. Second Street, Suite 2800  
Miami, Florida 33131  
305.539.8400

BY: ANDREW S. BRENNER, ESQUIRE  
abrenner@bsflp.com

Appearances continued on the next page.

1 APPEARANCES (CONTINUED) :

2  
3 Also present:

4 DEBORAH NEFF

5 BENDJA BEDEJUSTE

6 DANNY LEGRA

7 KATHRYN KARACIA

8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I N D E X  
VOLUME 27

PROCEEDINGS	PAGE
Plaintiff's Witness(es):	
ROBERT N. PROCTOR, Ph.D.	
DIRECT EXAMINATION	4518
BY MR. SCHLESINGER:	
CROSS EXAMINATION	4537
BY MR. GREEN:	
REDIRECT EXAMINATION	4549
BY MR. SCHLESINGER:	
RECROSS-EXAMINATION	4553
BY MR. GREEN:	
PLAINTIFF RESTS (PHASE II)	4571
JURY INSTRUCTED BY THE COURT (PHASE II)	4571
CLOSING ARGUMENT (PHASE II)	
BY MR. SCHLESINGER	4576
BY MR. PERSONS	4579
BY MR. BRENNER	4601
REBUTTAL ARGUMENT (PHASE II)	
BY MR. SCHLESINGER	4634



1 Mr. Schlesinger has asked for 10 million  
2 dollars in punitive damages against  
3 Philip Morris and 20 million dollars  
4 overall.

5 You decided in Phase I that 4 million  
6 dollars was the fair and full compensation  
7 for Ms. Neff's loss of her mother. Now  
8 plaintiff is asking that Ms. Neff be  
9 awarded 20 million additional dollars.  
10 Awarding a large sum of money to Mrs. Neff  
11 isn't going to make Philip Morris change  
12 its behavior for the simple reason that  
13 Philip Morris already has changed its  
14 behavior and changed it in a way that  
15 there is no turning back.

16 The Philip Morris of today in 2019  
17 operates in a very different environment  
18 than the environment you heard about in  
19 Phase I of the trial.

20 I want you to keep in mind one other  
21 thing Judge Haimes will instruct you, that  
22 you may decline to assess punitive  
23 damages. You have the discretion not to  
24 award punitive damages against one or  
25 either defendant.